

Steven B.: Good afternoon. I am Steven Bosacker, the still relatively new Director of Urban Policy at GMF. In that role, I get to be a shameless advocate for the role that cities play in solving for global issues. Having served as a chief of staff to a member of Congress, a Minnesota governor, and then as City Manager of Minneapolis, Minnesota for a number of years, I've come to admire the common sense, the tenacity, and the ingenuity that mayors, city managers, local community leaders exhibit really on a daily basis on issues large and small, that land at their doorstep. One such issue of the extremely large variety is climate change, and it really is exhibit A on where cities around the globe have stepped up to take a lead through innovative and tangible actions toward workable solutions.

Steven B.: Let me say a word about the Urban team at GMF. We try to isolate the promising practices and policies being used by cities on both sides of the Atlantic. On issues like building inclusive economies, managing migration, or finding new creative ways to involve marginalized communities. Then we work to spread that information horizontally to other cities or maybe more importantly vertically where there are gaps at a national or international policy level. Today, in the spirit of the overall theme of disruption, we're presenting the Brussels Forum First, a panel comprised entirely of mayors. In this case, it's three mayors that have taken specific actions to kick the carbon habit, and make a wholesale transition to renewable energy sources.

Steven B.: Two of the three were part of an EU-funded program we called appropriately the Energy Allies. This project was designed to leverage the expertise of nongovernmental actors or civil society, alongside local governments to develop successful partnership models. Having worked in the innovation space for the last 12 years in cities, if we're not breaking down the walls of city hall and any divisions within, on problems like this, we're not going to make any progress. The third mayor, the Honorable Chiara Appendino of Torino, Italy, brings the same level of commitment that will be required, if we're going to have any hope of making the kind of change needed to save our planet. Her commitment is so great that even when her flight was canceled to Berlin this morning in her connecting city, she ran back to Torino and we're going to hopefully have her live via video stream here shortly. We'll see, fingers crossed.

Steven B.: In addition, Torino was part of our transatlantic cities lab, where we partnered Torino with the City of Portland, Oregon, and helped both of them accelerate their sustainability initiatives. I'm going to leave it to this distinguished panel to share the successes and challenges of each city's quest. To facilitate that discussion, we are pleased to have a friend and former GMF Fellow ... Excuse me, a current GMF Fellow, as well as an MSNBC anchor and journalist, Richard Lui, back with us. Richard, I'll hand it over to you.

Richard L.: Thank you, sir. Thank you so much Steven. I'd like to welcome up our mayors to have a seat, and I am looking forward to listening to your open remarks as well as some of the great ideas that you're going to provide to us. I will start with the

... By the way, we do have Chiara Appendino, there in our video stream. You are on air and as we say, "Mayor, if you can hear us great?" The ears are coming in right now.

Chiara A.: Okay. Yes, I do hear you now.

Richard L.: All right. You can't hear us in. So this is great.

Chiara A.: Yes I do.

Richard L.: All the way from Turin, we have the mayor there, Appendino, thank you for being here. Mayor, id like to-

Chiara A.: Thank you. Sorry, for not being there physically.

Richard L.: All right, well, great. We're going to get to you in just a second. We're going to have opening remarks here on the floor, if you can see us. We had a great discussion before we walked out here, and so I'm really interested in your opening remarks here as we look at some of the solutions, the problems that you've been addressing. So please, the Mayor of Heidelberg Eckart Würzner.

Eckart W.: Yes. Good evening everybody. I'm very pleased to be here as the mayor for a wonderful city in Germany, which is called Heidelberg, a university town. We have a lot of activists. We are a green city, and I'm very proud that before we speak as mayors here, we have the activists from the young generation speaking to us. Because, this is like a wake up call for us. But I must say I'm now 12 years the mayor of this wonderful city. I'm also the city manager. I am having the political and also the management responsibility. And we as mayors, we have already formed an initiative, which we called the Mayors for Friday, if you might say this. We're not so called, but we are going this direction to show best results.

Eckart W.: What we have done for example in Heidelberg is reduced the total energy demand of all municipal buildings, kindergartens by more than 50% over the last 10 years, without having money. How we do this? Using private money from companies investing in our schools, and have a clear contract, which we call it Energy Contract, who give them the possibility to earn money, and us to implement very quickly new technical solutions in our existing buildings. Or, we transform our mobility system, which is very complicated. Today we have about 69% of all citizens using bicycle, going by foot or using the mass transport system. 69%. The rest is using still cars, but I think this is a very good quote. But if we're going along with a clear commitment, we noticed that we still didn't reach the target. This is our problem. We have already achieved a quite good level, but still we need more actions, and therefore we need also those activists from the local level, which gives us the power to go much further. Many thanks.

Richard L.: Mayor McGovern.

Marc M.: Thank you, and thank you to the German Marshall Fund for having me here today, and for all the work you do every day. Unlike another elected official in the United States, I actually believe in science, and ... I couldn't help it. The science is telling us that our world is in trouble. And so the simple answer to the question of, can and should municipalities take a leading role in addressing climate change, is yes. We have no choice. We need to. Let me tell you just quickly, a little bit about Cambridge. Cambridge is a city of 115000 people in six square miles. We are the eighth most densely populated city in the United States, the fourth largest city in Massachusetts. We are home to two relatively well known universities, MIT and Harvard. We're also home to Kendall Square. Kendall Square has the highest concentration of biotech companies in the world. And that cuts both ways.

Marc M.: The challenge is that labs use a tremendous amount of energy, and about 80% of our energy is used by those labs. The benefit, and this goes a little bit to, Eckart, about the private funding. The tax base brought on by the commercial industry in Cambridge has allowed us to do things that other cities simply have not been able to do. For example, we are building three brand new schools that will be net zero at a cost of half a billion dollars without raising any taxes, or without any state or federal assistance. We have been implementing more bike lanes. We have the lowest rate of driving of any city in the United States. We have also taken other local action. We were the largest city on the East Coast to ban plastic bags. We have banned polystyrene. We are currently writing an ordinance to ban single use plastic. We have citywide composting, and we have developed a Net Zero Action Plan to get Cambridge to be a net zero city by 2050.

Marc M.: We are not new to this conversation. The first ordinance passed by the City Council to address climate change was in 1994, and our first citywide plan to come up with a City Climate Change Plan was in 2002. We have been a leader in this area for quite a long time. We also work internationally. We were part of the German Marshall Fund effort last year. We have a partnership with Copenhagen, where we're sharing ideas, and we're also working with other cities across the country for, we all signed ... We're still here, pledge when Trump took the United States out of the Paris Accord. Cities, universities, companies said, "That doesn't speak for us. We're not leaving. We're not changing our commitment to addressing climate change." There is a tremendous amount that municipalities can do and are doing. Massachusetts is leading the way in the country, and Cambridge is leading the way in Massachusetts, and our commitment is unwavering. Thank you.

Richard L.: Thank you, mayor. Mayor Appendino. I hope you can hear us. You're opening remarks, please. We'd love to hear from you.

Chiara A.: First of all, I'm really sorry that I'm not there physically. As you said, but I had a problem with the airplane, and I really wanted to be at least with you, using new technologies. Well, two words only on our city. Torino is the fourth city in

Italy. We have as a city about 900000 people living, and it's an industrial city. I mean, it's well known because of FCA, which is x-Fiat, and because of the space economy. The city is changing very much because in the last years also thank to the Olympic Games that we had in 2006, the city has changed very much is becoming more a cultural city. We have these two very important parts that are the industry that is facing innovation, and is changing, and is facing the big challenges such as autonomous guide or self-driving cars, and the space economy. We have a very interesting and wonderful cultural site. And so, we have visitors that are increasing.

Chiara A.: Actually, we are physically in a very difficult place, which is the so called [Foreign language 00:11:07]. This means that Torino, my city, unfortunately because it's geographically in such a space, is one of the most polluted city. I'm talking about air pollution in Europe. So, what are we doing? First of all, we're working on the physical infrastructure, which means for example, that we just became a plastic free city. We are investing on extending the possibility by 2020. It's three years I'm mayor, so in my five years I will bring to the whole city the possibility to recycle, obviously waste. We are working on public transportation, so we are increasing public transportation. We have new buses, that do not pollute as the old ones.

Chiara A.: We are building and we're working on new Metro Line. These are examples of what is a physical infrastructure. A community, a city needs to invest in the physical infrastructure to face the challenge of the pollution and climate change. But the most important thing is, let's say, immaterial infrastructure, which is the cultural approach. I think that a city, to face really the challenges of climate change, that is a risk that we don't see, that is the most difficult thing that I'm facing. I mean, people see, for example, risk that can be ... I don't know, water increasing in the river, and they see it, but they don't see air pollution. They don't see climate change. Since they don't see the risk, the most difficult thing is to create the immaterial infrastructure to face that change, to understand that risk.

Chiara A.: And so, we're investing in communicating, we're investing in engaging the people to understand what is the risk, and help us with the physical infrastructure. For example, recycling, banning plastic, a new Metro Line, increasing public transportation, to understand the risk and use the solutions that we are helping. But the two things have to go together. It's not easy because what we are really feeling is that for example, when I ban the use of cars that are very ... And I did it, that pollute very much the air. We have people that are obviously very, very angry, because they don't understand what's happening, what they're seeing and they don't feel the risk. We have to work on both things, material infrastructure and immaterial infrastructure, which is the community. Mayors can do that because they have a direct contact with the people.

Richard L.: Mayor, I'd now like all of you to pull out your phones if you can. A quick question for you to help our mayors reflect on what you're thinking. Of course, we will have questions and answers at the latter part of this session. The question is very straight forward. If you pull out your app, and that is, let's get a sense for the moment about what you think. On a scale from one to five, five being the highest level, what is your level of concern about the consequences of global warming and climate change? One to five.

Richard L.: If you pull that out, let's see what most of our conferees think here. So far, not registering. On a scale from one to five, with five being the highest level, what is your level of concern about the consequences of global warming and climate change? Very high, now at 61% with the first numbers in. Very low, 0%. Low is 5.3, medium 8.8, and high 24.6. Mayor Würzner, surprising at all or pretty much what you think?

Eckart W.: It's a very good result, but the reality looks a little bit different if you go into the political debate. Because, mostly if you have the discussion about the city budget or the state budget, you notice that all of the investment, if we're talking about the material points, more infrastructure for mass transport system, better support also. For cities to implement those structures, you notice that the subsidies are near destabilized. They are not pumped up as it should be. It's mostly the role of the city itself, to take over this leading position. It's the same situation in United States, where you really notice that the cities are taking this leading position, and the state is not really the driving you need anymore.

Eckart W.: That's the reason why we are going this direction, and that's the reason why we are starting new networks, working together with the German Marshall Fund, or what we have created now, what we called the Covenant of Mayors. It's an organization of more than 10000 cities. I'm pleased to be in the World Board to say, "We have a clear commitment. We have accepted our targets. We had the political debate that we wanted to become, see a true free city till the year 2050, and we help us because if the state is not doing, we're doing.

Richard L.: Mayor Würzner, mayors is the right people to be doing this.

Marc M.: Well, one reason is that we are the closest to the people. It's a little bit easier on a municipal level at times to get things done than on the federal level. The reality is that the cities and mayors, we're going to be the first ones dealing with climate change. It's going to be ... There's a ... I don't have the percentage off the top of my head, but a pretty large percentage of Cambridge is in a flood plain. Those neighborhoods are unfortunately our lower-income neighborhoods. And so, when the Charles River or the Mystic River, both rivers that flow through Cambridge flood, it's going to be our communities that are going to have to deal, deal with it firsthand. And so, there is no other option, right? There is no other option for us, and on the municipal level.

Marc M.: Again, because of our connection with residents, with the community, it's easier. Cambridge believes very strongly in collaboration. When we developed our Net Zero Plan, it wasn't a top-down model. It wasn't the government saying, "Here's the plan." We brought Harvard, MIT, our business community, local residents. We have a number of local activist groups that are in Cambridge. Everybody at the table talking about, "How do we solve this problem? And how do we all buy-in to a plan to move us forward?" Cities can do that in a way that the federal and even the state government cannot.

Richard L.: Those tables aren't always a lot of fun to be on though.

Marc M.: Not always.

Richard L.: Right. Yeah. So how did you bring everybody around the table to sing Kumbaya at the end?

Marc M.: Pizza.

Richard L.: Pizza.

Marc M.: Lots of pizza.

Richard L.: A little bit of light beer, maybe.

Marc M.: Lots of pizza. You don't always get to Kumbaya moment.

Richard L.: Right.

Marc M.: Right? I mean, not everybody who walked away from participating in that thought we went far enough. Some people, some of the commercial folks that took part might've thought we went a little too far, because we're increasing our demands on commercial development to be sustainable, to build sustainable buildings. You don't always get to a place where everybody feels that it's perfect or everyone feels that it's happy 100%. But at the end of the day, if you don't get buy-in from all of the partners in your community and all of the stakeholders in your community, you're going to be continuing to push that boulder up a hill.

Richard L.: Mayor Appendino, how do you get small Kumbayas? How do you get small rocks up the hill?

Chiara A.: Well, actually you just got to go on and fight. I mean, it's true as the mayor was saying that, we as the mayors have the most possibility to change, and to make the change because we have the contact with the people. But it's also true that changing habits of people is very difficult. Because for example, when I say we all agree that we have to do something for climate change, but when you start

saying that you have to reduce, for example, the amount of meat you're eating. Do we all agree? When you start asking that you have to leave your car at home and use the bus? Do we really all agree? When we ask the people to recycle, which takes more time. Do we really all agree and all do it? That's the big difficult part, because when you have to change your own habits, then it's the big challenge.

Chiara A.: I think as mayors we have to show the way and continue fighting even if very often, we hear the words of the people that do not agree with what you're doing. But actually I am sure, and I mean what's happening all around the world and as [inaudible 00:19:20] is saying that, there is a big part of the population, especially youth that is aware and is ready for that change. We just have to continue and walk and walk and walk. "Do you want to bicycle?" "I got the bicycle and I have to just go on cycling."

Richard L.: Mayor. How do you describe climate change to your residents? Your voters? Yeah, how do you-

Chiara A.: It's to me?

Richard L.: Yeah.

Chiara A.: Well, okay. [inaudible 00:19:41] a place, I mean the city. We have a very big river, the Po river, and it's also narrow where there can be a flood. I always tell them we had a flood two years ago. I always say, "Do you see that river? That river? The water is increasing. We had a flood. You see that risk?" "Yes." Okay. I always say, "Well, with climate change it's much worse because you don't see it, but it's going on." We actually are feeling it today. Yesterday we had 50°C here in Torino. I mean it's not normal. We are one hour from the mountains, so we also start feeling it. Okay. I think that people are aware. They're starting to be aware, but the very difficult thing is to change habits.

Chiara A.: That's why we have to work as mayors to make people understand that we all have that responsibility. You can't just ask politicians to do something, we have to do it. We are doing it. Some are doing it more, some are doing less, but it's a whole community that has to do that. So we're trying to engage people of the community, influencers, people that believe in this, and show, and how we can change our behavior to really have an impact on climate change.

Richard L.: Mayor Würzner. How do you sell it? How do you sell this?

Eckart W.: Yeah, how do we sell it? I think it's, in my opinion it has a lot of, a lot to do with behavior and understanding. But if you're going, for example, to a school, and I ask you and you're the head of the school, "Are you willing to cooperate with the city?" "So you reduce the energy demand of your building, and we help you to get money for computers, whatever." That's what we have done. We achieved about 25% of all the schools who signed a contract with the city. If



they reduced the energy bill, but by just changing their behavior, just changing their behavior. They achieve already a reduction of nearly 20 to 25%. Nobody cares about because at the beginning, everybody was a little bit nervous about this, but then we had an award after one year. The schools were taking part, get double of the money they normally get for books, computers and else. By just reducing the energy bill, we have more money to subsidize the schools with important education programs.

Eckart W.: Or if you're talking with smaller medium enterprises, how can you support them? What we are doing is, we are giving them free advice for energy reduction concepts or waste reduction concepts. Now, at the beginning, not so much SMEs wanted to cooperate with us. But through this program, we have now more 100 companies who are working together. For example, the bakery using the heat, which they were not using before for preheating or precooling the ovens for producing bread. Now, the same bakery has doubled the money free, by reducing their energy bill for better ingredients for their products. And they can be better on the market with new, more green economic growth. These are concrete results, but you have to create these structures.

Richard L.: Sure. How does the rubber hit the road here then? That was a great idea of ovens that you brought up. What's one of the things that you've implemented on the ground. Give us a tangible idea here, Mayor McGovern.

Marc M.: Sure. I think ... I mean, I agree with my fellow mayors about changing behavior. I have to admit I'm a little lucky being the Mayor of Cambridge. Cambridge is a very progressive city, and so there's not a lot of convincing that I have to do. If anything, it's people who want to go incredibly fast and government sometimes doesn't move as quickly as folks and the community would like. I don't really have the problem of convincing my constituency that climate change is real. But just to give you an example, I'll use the banning of plastic bags as an example. We were the largest city on the East Coast of the United States to do that. We brought our local business associations and retail establishments in. We can pass all kinds of policies and ordinances at the government level, but it's the people living in our city that have to after, deal with them. Right?

Marc M.: We wanted to make sure that we got our business community on board, explaining to them why banning plastic bags was an important environmental step. Then working with them to figure out how are we going to help offset the cost impacts that they're going to, that will impact them so that we're not impacting their bottom line? There's a 10 cent fee for buying a bag in Cambridge, which that money goes back to the retailer to help offset the costs of banning plastic bags. That's just a quick example. But again, it's about bringing people to the table and pulling in the same direction.

Richard L.: How long did it take for you to implement that?



Marc M.: Well, it's some fits and starts. We have two year terms in Cambridge, and sometimes as the council changes over, things that you make some progress and then you take some steps back. It had been talked about for probably about six or eight years, and different councils took different levels of action. But once this current council took effect, we passed it rather quickly.

Richard L.: How's rather quickly?

Marc M.: Probably within the first six to eight months of our-

Richard L.: Six to eight months.

Marc M.: But, we also took a year to implement. We passed it and then we said it's going to go into effect a year later. During that time was continued conversation with the community.

Richard L.: So you were to implement, and now, how long has it been?

Marc M.: About three years, four years.

Richard L.: Three years. What's the assessment now, three years in?

Marc M.: Like anything when you're talking about change, the sky's going to fall. "Oh my God, we're going to get rid of plastic bags. How am I going to live?"

Richard L.: Did it fall?

Marc M.: No, it did not.

Richard L.: Okay.

Marc M.: We're used to it now. It's really a nonissue.

Richard L.: Great.

Marc M.: Sometimes you just have to take that leap and make that change, and you get used to it.

Richard L.: Okay, great. Mayor Appendino, one of the ideas that you can bring here to the forum for us, that you have implemented. Give us the idea of cost, give us the idea of how long it took to implement as well.

Chiara A.: For example, in the City of Turin, the infrastructure for recycling in the city, had been stopped. It was two years that nobody accented it. We did a five year plan to extend it in the whole city. So by the end of the five years, I will have the whole city with the infrastructure for recycling. What we did is that we built a

contest, so that the municipality in Turin, in the city, that recycles the most will have less taxation, the year later. It's a sort of way that we have a contest. If you're good at recycling, you have an advantage as a local community, and the next year you will pay less than the others. We give the infrastructure, which has exactly the possibility to recycle, and we put the community in competition, and the one that does the best, will have taxation advantage the year after. It's sort of a game, and we are doing also the same thing in the schools. Hoping to, I mean explain, give an infrastructure and also give a small way to have a reduction the year later on the taxation.

Richard L.: How long did it take for you to implement this?

Chiara A.: Well, the whole city, five years.

Richard L.: Five years you said. Okay.

Chiara A.: Yes.

Richard L.: Cost?

Chiara A.: It's about €15 million to infrastructure the whole city.

Richard L.: Great. Thank you. Mayor Würzner, as you think about why mayors are the line of defense, if you will, when it comes to climate change and solutions, how do you work with other cities? For instance, when we talk about the transatlantic relationship, how do you get best practices? How do you work together with a mayor, that might be in Cambridge for instance, to take an idea away?

Eckart W.: I think we started about 15 years ago with creating new networks like [inaudible 00:27:42], like ICLEI, like the C40 network, which was greatly supported by Bloomberg. Working together exchanged our experiences. This was at the beginning, the first phase. So examples, changing examples. But what we noticed is, these examples are not leading to the results. What we have done then is a clear commitment. We sign a clear commitment with clear targets. We wanted to become fossil fuel free. We wanted to achieve to be 2025 green or in this field, or in this field. So what we need is a clear target, which will be revolved every second year, in the city council discussed and then sent to our international network, the Covenant of Mayors. Because if you are doing so, you're coming from the kilowatt hour to the megawatt hour.

Eckart W.: For example, building efficient buildings. Every city is building efficient buildings. But if it's just examples, they don't care anybody. What we're doing now is for example in Heidelberg, we built over the last eight years, the new city, 100% CO2 free. How? We force everybody who wants to build a building in these area to build a fossil fuel free building, so it's a super efficient building. We can force them because we were becoming the landlord. We can't force, if it's not legal from the federal level, to force them to do so. And by doing so, we really could

change the megawatt hours. This is very important to come from the best practice examples to a really movement away from the fossil fuel driven consumption and industry. That's the way we have to solve the problem, because otherwise the time is running out

Richard L.: In the environment of the Paris Accord, you do bring it up here Mayor McGovern. What are some of the ways you work with other mayors to bring good ideas to your town?

Marc M.: Yeah. As I mentioned in the opening, we're part of the, We Are Still In coalition, with cities around the country, around the United States as well as universities and corporations. We're also part of, Cambridge is also a part of a Metro Boston coalition of 14 cities that are all working together to address issues of climate change, and reduce our dependence on fossil fuels. It's partnering with other cities. It's setting the example. As I mentioned, some of the things that we've done on a local level in Cambridge from plastic bags to citywide composting, to banning polystyrene, other cities have followed our lead. And so it's about getting out in front and leading, but also making sure that you're bringing other cities because we know, Cambridge can be the most environmentally sustainable city in the world, but it's a grain of sand in the big beach. We know that we can do a lot of things, but really where it hits the road is how do you get other cities, other states, other countries to buy-in and do their part as well.

Richard L.: Mayor Appendino, what other grains of sand do you work with around the world, as you not only develop best practices for your city, but how you work with these other localities, federal governments, states, what have you, to make your ideas better and stronger, to make a bigger wave, if you will?

Chiara A.: Actually, we work at all levels. For example, we are working just a few months ago, we signed with Milan and Genova, an agreement that all three cities are engaged to reduce 40% CO2 emissions by 2030. We are working with the regional government. It's a bit more difficult because our regional government at the moment, is not so ... I mean we are fighting actually. For example, we are saying that we have to block the cars because these have diesel in particular, because this has an important impact and the regional government, they're telling us to take away that block. There is a bit of a fight with the regional level, but we are working very well with the national level. We had a very important event, Clean Air Dialogue for the first time in Italy, for the first time here in Turin, with the Minister Costa, where the national government actually, put money for three years, that will arrive to the city's to implement certain things that will help to fight climate change.

Chiara A.: It's money on public transportation, it's money on, obviously, everything that has to do with climate change. For example in our case, we are developing with the national government for the first time in Italy, a program where if you change your car because your car is polluting a lot, we don't give you money for a new car that pollutes less, but we give you money to use public

transportation, which is very new in Italy. It has never happened. We're doing it with the national government. We give you a sort of benefit because you change your car, but you cannot use the benefit to buy a new car, but you have to use it on public transportation. It's a way to let people change their habits, help them change their habits and go on public transportation.

Richard L.: If you could take out your phones, one other question before-

Chiara A.: Oh, yeah. Sorry.

Richard L.: ... questions and answers. Mayor Appendino, thank you for that. Give me a word or two. How do we tackle climate change? What are the ideas from all of our participants, from your spaces? The ideas that you might bring to this discussion. If you pull out your phone, we have 60 seconds. In one word, how do we tackle climate change? In one word, how do we tackle climate change? Drastic. Nudging. Awareness. Responsibility. Mandates. Awareness. Responsibility. Personal. That's ... Veganism. Education. Yes. There we go. 20 more seconds. Ambition. Incentives. Flying. That's what ... Mayor Appendino, I thought you were making a statement today, because we're on climate change. Carbon. Taxes. Great. Very quickly reaction, 30 seconds. Mayor Würzner, to what you're seeing. Very quickly.

Eckart W.: 30 seconds. We need more regulation, not only words to implement. I think that's very important. On the other hand, I think we have to show a good example. We as cities and also companies. There is a clear message from our cities, "We're not buying anymore stupid buses. If they are not CO2 free, we don't buy them anymore. We buy no electricity if it's not green." So a clear message, anybody who wants to sell something to cities, we're not willing to buy them anymore. Clear commitments by the city councils, clear commitments by the cities. This is a message for everybody.

Richard L.: Policy through dollars. Questions from the audience here. I'll come over to you over here. Excuse me. I got it. Good to see you.

Ria Batla: Well, good to see you. My name is Ria Batla. I'm with the Brunswick Group. Mayor Würzner, thanks so much for sharing your experiences, and it's been incredible what you've been doing. You said you huddled back as a city of activists, and I guess your policies also cater to kind of their positions. Now what if that is not the case? I'm from a small town in East Germany, and I feel like the debate that we're having there, it's not about energy storage of building, it's more about, having working in the schools, it's not about, "Look at that lake." Like you said, it's more about looking at the holes in the street, and it's not about engaging school [inaudible 00:35:25], it's more about keeping them in the cities and keeping them from moving to other parts of Germany. What is your advice to those? How do you engage people from communities where climate change is not seen as a risk but rather as a threat?

Eckart W.: So clear question to me. I would say we have to work together. We have totally different positions. We have also totally different responsibilities. If you see that I am responsible for city utility, for the traffic utility, so I have a great position to change a lot. Not many mayors have such a position. But we have of course, the situation that in some areas we have ... Especially in rural areas, not only in Germany, it's all over the world. We have a totally different situation because they need money, they need support. We have to keep in mind that if the movement is just taking place in some areas and some cities, which is in [inaudible 00:36:16], in Heidelberg the case, we can't have enough affordable houses anymore because everybody wants to live in those cities, that we have to support those structures. But by doing so, we have to say that we have to solve the problem together and try to engage through partnering those projects. Where for example, we have a city partnership with [inaudible 00:36:36].

Eckart W.: [inaudible 00:36:36], is a city which is quite much under pressure now through right-wing groups. Also if they have no refugees, Heidelberg has about 80000 refugees over the last three years, by a city population of 160000, and we have no right wing movement. Because of the quiet good understanding of the population that we have to play a humanity role. If we are not working globally, this movement will go on. Or it's just the beginning of a movement which we can't stop then, any more.

Richard L.: Quickly.

Marc M.: Yeah. Can I share a quick example? In Cambridge there was a group formed called Mothers Out Front. This was a group that started by three or four moms that were sitting around a kitchen table talking about the world that we were going to leave to their children. That group has now become national. It has major partners in Cambridge in terms of the discussion on climate change, and a major leader in the state. It could take three or four people sitting around a kitchen table to make a difference. I would certainly encourage you to get some people around the table and start having that conversation.

Richard L.: And a kitchen table.

Marc M.: Yes.

Ida: Hello, my name is Ida and I'm from the Young Greens in Sweden. First of all, I just want you all to think about that it's really good that we are discussing climate change at Brussels Forums. But there are two companies that are sponsoring Brussels Forums that are actually destroying our planet. So I just want you to like reflect about that. Second of all, I want to talk about policy. This is mostly on national level, but I really want to hear what you think about it. The Young Greens in Sweden, we made the government in Sweden to introduce flight taxes in Sweden. We have had the taxes for one year, and we are seeing

that the flights are decreasing with 5%, and that a lot of people are taking the train. Is that something that your country maybe should introduce?

Richard L.: Mayor Appendino?

Chiara A.: Well, actually, I mean it's difficult to ask a mayor, because we don't have that power. But actually in general, the fact that we can use taxation to change the habits, it's true. For example, in my city, we are working at the moment, I have a very big fight in particular, a part of the city is fighting against this. We are introducing a limited traffic zone, a sort of congestion charge so that you have to pay to go in with the car. We think that this could change and will change habits, and will, let's say, help us to reduce the use of cars and to change to another kind of mobility. I think at the same way, I don't have really information on how the flight tax could work and how actually it could move. But in our case, in Torino, we have studies that show that if you introduce taxation, you change and can change the habits. I think that taxation is a good instrument, and in fact we are working on that on our community level.

Richard L.: Mayor Würzner, how do you not do too much?

Eckart W.: Yeah, I just want to make a comment to this because we are talking about companies who are destroying the climate. I think you are absolutely right. If those companies are changing their mind, but we need still those companies. If we don't have any companies, we have no jobs. If we don't get the awareness of the CEOs and some are sitting here, that they have to change their fleet into a green fleet, and this is a huge market. If they don't understand that we are fighting for a new green economy, we are not fighting for non-economy. This is a stupid discussion.

Eckart W.: By doing so, we notice that those who are going in the lead position to create green buses, fuel cell buses, electro buses. They're taking the lead and if we look at this, we noticed, "Hey, the old economy is too sleepy." We have now companies in China, some in Poland and some in Netherlands, who are producing better electric buses than the former units. This is a case, if the companies are taking not into account, that there is a big movement already and that they have to change their mind.

Richard L.: Two questions on the board. Anybody wants to react to them here, I'll read it out loud. Is a net zero economic sustainable future possible without nuclear energy? The second, the U.K. has recently halved it's national net zero target from 2050 to 2025, which the chancellor warned would cost the U.K. 1 trillion pounds. How do you balance economic prosperity with climate action in your cities? Will one always be at the expense of the other? That was a head nod to how do you right size it, right? Because there's only a certain amount of appetite at a certain time.

Marc M.: Yeah. We better get the appetite to address this. I think some of this, getting back to your question earlier, and also about companies. We have companies that, and right in Cambridge, that are making a tremendous amount of money. They need to start thinking, not so much about their bottom line and making hundreds and hundreds of millions of dollars in the immediate benefit of that, but where is their company? Where is their city? Where is the population going to be in 10, 20, 30, 40 years? Something that mayors deal with all the time. Now, I am so jealous that you have an eight year term. As mayor, mine is two. And so, what we deal with all the time is, how do we move quickly because we only have so much time that we are going to be in office. Right?

Richard L.: How do we do that?

Marc M.: We also have to think about ... I can't think just about my two years. I have to think about where Cambridge is going to be 25 years from now, 50 years from now. Companies need to start thinking that way too. Many are, but many still are not. And so, yes, maybe there's some immediate economic impact, but I can't speak for Europe, but in the United States, I'm not sure that a CEO needs to make 400% or 500% more than the people that work for their company. It is changing our view of how much is enough. Right? And where are we going to be in 50 years? You can have all the money in the world, but in 50 years, if we're under water, it's not going to help you much.

Richard L.: Two questions here.

Mohammed S.: Yes. Thank you. My Name is Mohammed Saiful-deen. I'm an elected official at the City of Alexandria. I'm a councilman, home of George Washington. To our European friends, China just implemented a rule where they're no longer accepting American recycles. I'm not sure if that effected you guys or how you dealt with it, if they did implement that. To our American at Cambridge, have you dealt with the lead certification for public versus private development? How did that go? And which one did you adopt?

Richard L.: All right, hold on. I got another question right across the way here. You can pick, which question you're answering.

Maribel: Hi, my name is Maribel from Finland, and as a vice counselor myself, I do agree that it is extremely important for us to act at the local level, but also at the same time we all know that it's also important for us to influence our parliaments, our governments, our countries. For example in Finland, the six biggest cities get together to meet from time to time and discuss these issues. I would like to know that, do you in a way try to influence your governments to actually take bigger steps and if so, how?

Richard L.: Okay. Who would like to take any of those?



- Marc M.: Well, I'll just go real quickly do require lead certification on municipal buildings, and we do push our private developers to do the same. I'm going to look to my gold. I'm going to look my partner in crime over here, who does all the work?
- Mohammed S.: Is that a goal for both public ... goal for both public and private? Or how long have you had that in place? We just voted last week on it.
- Marc M.: I don't know. How long, Susan?
- Susan: The standard for municipal buildings is first, fossil fuel free. [inaudible 00:44:41]. We've tasked ourselves to go fossil fuel free from municipal building. That's where we're at. The gold standard has been a requirement for probably a year now.
- Richard L.: Let the record show, the gentleman from Alexandria, did a thumbs-up to the gold.
- Marc M.: Great.
- Richard L.: Let the record show. Okay, please.
- Eckart W.: A quick comment. I think it's very important to notice that not only the cities, or the regions can solve the problem. We are really on the ground, but we need the state level of course, and we need the super national level like the EU. That's exactly what we do. We just had a big conference, the ICCA, International Conference in Climate Action four weeks ago in Heidelberg, where we first time tried to bring those partners together. Because what we noticed is that there is a coming up understanding that cities are also lead partners, not an NGO level. That's the reason why we sat. If a UN conference is taking place, cities have to be sitting on the same table as equal partners, which is not the case still yet, and that we send out a clear message. We want to get rid out of subsidies for fossil fuel industry partners, and that we wanted and that we need an energy pricing, we call it an energy pricing, to get the money for those trillions or billions because otherwise we have to spend it for adaptation.
- Richard L.: We've reached the end of this fantastic conversation. I would like all of our mayors, if you don't mind, to do something which you do not like to do. If you could, your closing statement in 15 seconds, that would be great. I will start with the mayor that said, "Don't do this to me first." Mayor Würzner, please. 15 seconds.
- Eckart W.: 15 seconds. Let us not talk, let us take action. Everybody on his field, and then we achieve really big results.
- Richard L.: He was ready. You see, he was ready. Mayor Appendino, if you can, 15 seconds to close this up here.

Eckart W.: We have to change our habits, and everybody has to change his own way of approaching the thing. We don't have to fear the change. First of all, before asking what others have to do, ask ourselves what we have to do and change every day our own habits. That's the only way.

Richard L.: All right. Mayor McGovern, 15 seconds.

Marc M.: Something I often say in Cambridge is, "It's easy to be a good progressive until you're asked to sacrifice something for it." So, sacrifice, urgency, action. That's the 15 seconds.

Richard L.: A warm round of applause. There you go. Very well done. For our mayors. Mayor Appendino, thank you so much. Mayor Würzner, thank you so much. And Mayor McGovern, fantastic conversation.

Marc M.: Thank you.

Richard L.: Now for all of you, if you could put your attention to the screen, we have a short video for you.